1	KAMALA D. HARRIS		
2	Attorney General of California MARC D. GREENBAUM		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LESLIE A. WALDEN		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 196882		
5	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702 Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 897-3465		
6	Facsimile: (213) 897-2804 Attorneys for Complainant		
7	-	RE THE	
8	DEPARTMENT OF C	ONSUMER AFFAIRS E POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION	
9		CALIFORNIA	
10			
11	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues Against:	Case No. 998990	
12	CENTRAL STATE UNIVERSITY OF		
13	BUSINESS AND TECHNOLOGY; KUANG CHUNG CHEN	STATEMENT OF ISSUES	
14 15			
16	Approval to Operate Non-Accredited Institution Applicant		
17	Respondent.		
18			
19			
20	Complainant alleges:		
21	PARTIES		
22	1. Joanne Wenzel (Complainant) brings this Statement of Issues solely in her official		
23	capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education, Department of		
24	Consumer Affairs.		
25	2. On or about August 2, 2010, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education		
26	(Bureau) received an application for Approval to Operate Non-Accredited Institution from		
27	Central State University of Business and Technology; Kuang Chung Chen (collectively, "Respondent"). On or about July 29, 2010, Kuang Chung Chen certified under penalty of perjury		
28	Respondent J. On or about July 29, 2010, Kuai	ig Chang Chen certified under penalty of perjury	
		1	

California Private Postsecondary Education Act of 2009, Ed. Code §§ 94800 et seq.

- "(d) The institution maintains a withdrawal policy and provides refunds.
- "(e) The directors, administrators, and faculty are properly qualified.
- "(f) The institution is financially sound and capable of fulfilling its commitments to students.
- "(g) That, upon satisfactory completion of an educational program, the institution gives students a document signifying the degree or diploma awarded.
- "(h) Adequate records and standard transcripts are maintained and are available to students.
- "(i) The institution is maintained and operated in compliance with this chapter and all other applicable ordinances and laws.

7. Section 94886 states:

"Except as exempted in Article 4 (commencing with Section 94874) or in compliance with the transition provisions in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a person shall not open, conduct, or do business as a private postsecondary educational institution in this state without obtaining an approval to operate under this chapter."

8. Section 94887:

"An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the applicant has the capacity to satisfy the minimum operating standards. The bureau shall deny an application for an approval to operate if the application does not satisfy those standards."

9. Section 94909 states as follows:

- "(a) Prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:
 - "

"(2) Except as specified in Article 2 (commencing with Section 94802), a statement that the institution is a private institution and that it is approved to operate by the bureau.

٠,,

"(7) Information regarding the faculty and their qualifications.

"(9) The schedule of total charges for a period of attendance and an estimated schedule of total charges for the entire educational program.

"(11) A statement specifying that, if a student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund, and that, if the student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of the moneys not paid from federal student financial aid program funds.

"(14) A description of the student's rights and responsibilities with respect to the Student Tuition Recovery Fund. This statement shall specify that it is a state requirement that a student who pays his or her tuition is required to pay a state-imposed assessment for the Student Tuition Recovery Fund. This statement shall also describe the purpose and operation of the Student Tuition Recovery Fund and the requirements for filing a claim against the Student Tuition Recovery Fund.

··...

- "(16) A statement specifying whether the institution, or any of its degree programs, are accredited by an accrediting agency recognized by the United States Department of Education. If the institution is unaccredited and offers an associate, baccalaureate, master's, or doctoral degree, or is accredited and offers an unaccredited program for an associate, baccalaureate, master's, or doctoral degree, the statement shall disclose the known limitations of the degree program, including, but not limited to, all of the following:
- "(A) Whether a graduate of the degree program will be eligible to sit for the applicable licensure exam in California and other states.
- "(B) A degree program that is unaccredited or a degree from an unaccredited institution is not recognized for some employment positions, including, but not limited to, positions with the State of California.

1	"(C) That a student enrolled in an unaccredited institution is not eligible for federal	
2	financial aid programs.	
3	64 22	
4	REGULATORY PROVISIONS	
5	10. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71100 states as follows:	
6	"(a) An applicant seeking approval to operate pursuant to Section 94886 of the Code, other	
7	than Approval to Operate by Accreditation pursuant to Section 94890(a)(1) of the Code, shall	
8	complete the "Application for Approval to Operate for an Institution Not Accredited," Form	
9	Application 94886 (rev. 2/10). An applicant seeking approval to operate by accreditation pursuant	
10	to Section 94890(a)(1) of the Code shall comply with section 71390.	
11	"(b) An applicant shall submit the completed form, the information or documentation	
12	required by this Article, the appropriate application fee as provided in Section 94930.5(a)(1) of	
13	the Code, and any appropriate annual fee as required by Article 1 of Chapter 5 of this Division, to	
14	the Bureau.	
15	"(c) An application that fails to contain all of the information required by this article shall	
16	render it incomplete.	
17	11. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71710 subdivision (c)(4), (6)	
18	and (7) state as follows:	
19	"In order to meet its mission and objectives, the educational program defined in section	
20	94837 of the Code shall be comprised of a curriculum that includes:	
21	"	
22	"(c) course or module materials that are designed or organized by duly qualified	
23	faculty. For each course or module, each student shall be provided with a syllabus or course	
24	outline that contains:	
25	"(4) sequence and frequency of lessons or class sessions;	
26	"…	
27	"(6) sequential and detailed outline of subject matter to be addressed or a list of	
28	skills to be learned and how those skills are to be measured;	
- 1	1	

i	l '
1	"(7) instructional mode or methods."
2	"…
3	12. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71715, subdivision (d)(3) states
4	as follows:
5	"···
6	"(d) Distance education as defined in section 94834 of the Code, does not require the
7	physical presence of students and faculty at the same location but provides for interaction
8	between students and faculty by such means as telecommunication, correspondence, electronic
9	and computer augmented educational services, postal service, and facsimile transmission. In
10	addition to the other requirements of this chapter and the Act, an institution offering distance
11	education shall:
12	",,,
13	"(3) ensure that the materials and programs are current, well organized, designed by
14	faculty competent in distance education techniques and delivered using readily available, reliable
15	technology;"
16	"····
17	13. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71720, subdivision (a) states as
18	follows:
19	"(a) An Educational Program Leading to a Degree.
20	"(1) An institution offering an educational program that leads to a degree shall
21	employ duly qualified faculty sufficient in number to provide the instruction, student advisement
22	and learning outcomes evaluation necessary for the institution to document its achievement of its
23	stated mission and objectives, and for students to achieve the specific learning objectives of each
24	course offered;
25 ⁻	"(2) Each institution shall develop and implement written policies and procedures
26	providing for the participation by duly qualified faculty in the conducting of research,
27	development of curricula, academic planning, enforcement of standards of academic quality,
28	

2.7

"(B) The degree, professional license, or credential possessed by the person shall be at least equivalent to the level of instruction being taught or evaluated;

- "(5) The institution's faculty as a whole shall possess a diverse educational background which shall be demonstrated in part by earned degrees from a variety of colleges and universities or by credentials generally recognized in the field of instruction;
- "(6) When contracting for educational services, the institution shall maintain control of, and responsibility for, all academic matters, and shall assure that the instruction and faculty satisfy the standards established by the Act and this chapter;
- "(7) The institution shall not employ or continue to employ any faculty who were adjudicated in a judicial or administrative proceeding as having violated any provision of the Act or this chapter or as having committed any act that would constitute grounds for the denial of a license under Section 480 of the Business and Professions Code;
- "(8) Each institution shall have a written Academic Freedom Policy which describes the latitude the institution allows faculty in the classroom so faculty will not inadvertently violate the principles of academic freedom. These policies shall be made available to any person upon request. The institution shall not take adverse action based on a staff member's exercise of academic freedom consistent with the institution's policy; and
- "(9) The institution shall maintain records documenting that each faculty member is duly qualified and was qualified to perform the duties to which the faculty member was assigned, including providing instruction, evaluating learning outcomes, evaluating graduate dissertations, theses, and student projects, and participating on doctoral committees."

* . . .

- 14. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71735, subdivision (a) (1) and (2) state as follows:
- "(a) An institution shall have sufficient facilities and necessary equipment to support the achievement of the educational objectives of all of the courses and educational programs in which students are enrolled. If an institution represents that the educational service will fit or prepare a

student for employment in a particular occupation or as described in particular job titles, either of the following conditions shall be met:

- "(1) The equipment used for instruction or provided to the student shall be comparable in model type or features to equipment generally used in those occupations or job titles at the time the instruction is offered.
- "(2) The institution shall establish that the equipment used for instruction or provided to a student is not obsolete and is sufficient for instructional purposes to reasonably assure that a student acquires the necessary level of education, training, skill, and experience to obtain employment in the field of training and to perform the tasks associated with the occupation or job title to which the educational program was represented to lead.

- 15. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71740 states as follows:
- "(a) A degree granting institution shall make available for student use a library and other learning resources.
- "(b) An institution shall provide or make provisions for the library and other learning resources needed to support each educational program it offers, including resources such as reference works, periodicals, monographs, and media and equipment specific to the educational programs offered.
- "(c) An institution shall describe onsite library and other learning resources, if any, that enable students to pursue inquiries, searches for information and documentation, and assignments connected with their study programs.
- "(d) An institution that depends for library and other learning resources primarily on other institutions' collections and resources not in its possession shall do all of the following:
- "(1) Describe those library and other learning resources, in the application and catalog.
- "(2) Provide students and faculty with access to the regular services of a professional librarian or information specialist experienced in the electronic retrieval of information, who shall

1	"(a) The name and address of the institution and the addresses where instruction will be	
2	provided.	
3	"	
4	"(d) Date by which the student must exercise his or her right to cancel or withdraw, and the	
5	refund policy, including any alternative method of calculation if approved by the Bureau pursuant	
6	to section 94921 of the Code."	
7	دد • • • • •	
8	18. Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71810, subdivision (b) states as	
9	follows:	
10	"···	
11	"(b) The catalog shall contain the information prescribed by Section 94909 of the Code and	
12	all of the following:	
13	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
14	"(7) The institution's policies and procedures for the award of credit for prior	
15	experiential learning, including assessment policies and procedures, provisions for appeal, and all	
16	charges that a student may be required to pay;	
17	"(8) The institution's standards for student achievement;	
18	"(9) A description of the facilities and of the types of equipment and materials that	
19	will be used for instruction;	
20	"(10) A description of library and other learning resources and the procedures for	
21	student access to those resources;	
22	····	
23	CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION	
24	(Incomplete Application)	
25	19. Respondent's application is subject to denial under section 480 subdivision (a)(3)(A),	
26	Education Code section 94885, 94886 and 94887, and California Code of Regulations, title 5,	
27	division 7.5, section 71100, in that Respondent submitted an incomplete application to the	
28	Bureau. Each violation is a sole and separate cause for denial. The violations are as follows:	

a. <u>Facilities.</u> Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations (CCR), section 71735 subdivision (a) in that it proposes a floor plan that indicates a maximum occupancy of 30 individuals with 10 parking spaces, which is not adequate space for the projected 110 students that the institution anticipates over the next three (3) years.

b. Exemplars of Student Agreements.

- 1. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR, section 71800 subdivision (a) in that the Enrollment Agreement does not indicate where the instruction will be provided.
- 2. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR, section 71800 subdivision (d) in that the Enrollment Agreement does not provide the date by which the student must exercise his or her right to cancel or withdraw.

c. <u>Instruction and Degrees Offered.</u>

- 1. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR, section 71710 subdivision (c)(4), (6) and (7) in that the course syllabi submitted for Bachelor, Masters and Doctorate programs failed to include the following: i) sequence and frequency of lessons or class sessions; ii) sequential and detailed outline of subject matter to be addressed or a list of skills to be learned and how those skills are measured; and iii) instructional methods.
- 2. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR, section 71720 subdivision (a)(2) in that Bureau is unable to determine who developed the following course syllabi:
 - i) BA 6000 Critique of Research in Business Administration,
 - ii) BA 6100 Case Studies in Business Administration,
 - iii) BA 6400 Technology and Information System management,
 - iv) BA 6750 Practice in Organizational Development, and
 - v) ED 5300 Facilities Planning and Evaluation.

d. <u>Distance Educational Programs.</u> Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR, section 71715 subdivision (d)(3) in that the Bureau is unable to determine from the materials submitted whether or not Respondent is requesting to offer distance education, and if so, it has failed to provide and demonstrate the availability of reliable technology to deliver any component of distance education.

e. Catalog.

- 1. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under California Education Code (CEC), section 94909, subdivision (a)(2) in that the proposed catalog does not contain a statement that the institution is a private institution that is approved to operate by the Bureau.
- 2. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CEC, section 94909, subdivision (a)(9) in that the proposed catalog provides incorrect total charges for a period of attendance in the MBA program, and does not contain a schedule of charges for a period of attendance and an estimated schedule of total charges for the entire educational programs in Bachelor of Business, Master and Doctor Education, Master of Science in Computer Information System, and Doctor of Business Administration.
- 3. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR sections 71770, subdivision (c) and 71810 subdivision (b)(7) in that the Respondent's policies and procedures for awarding credit for prior experiential learning, including assessment policies and procedure, are out of compliance as it fails to include the following:
- i) The prior learning is equivalent to a college or university level of learning.
- ii) The learning experience demonstrates a balance between theory and practice.

Respondent's catalog does not include a description of the facilities and the types of equipment and materials that will be used for instruction.

- 6. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR section 71810 subdivision (b)(10) in that the Respondent's catalog fails to provide the procedure that students and staff must follow for using the library at the University of the West, and failed to disclose the "guest user policy" at the University of the West, which requires a \$60 annual fee for guest users.
- 7. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CEC section 94909 subdivision (a)(16)(A)-(C) in that the Respondent's catalog failed to disclose to prospective students, prior to enrollment, whether or not the institution or the degree program is accredited.

e. <u>Faculty</u>.

- 1) Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR section 71720 subdivision (a)(4)(A)(1) and (2), and (B) in that the Respondent's implementation of sections 87359 and 87360 to grant degree equivalency is out of compliance with section CEC 94885, subdivision (e) as CEC sections 87359 and 87360 were enacted for Community College Educational Institutions and Respondent would be considered a private Post Secondary Education Institution.
- 2) Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR section 71720 subdivision (a)(4)(A) and (B) in that the Bureau is unable to determine if faculty employed by the Respondent meet the following minimum qualifications:
- i) The four (4) faculty listed in the catalog and application are not duly qualified to teach the Doctoral program in Business: Gary Chen, MBA, James Chen, MBA, George Chang, MS in Management Sciences and Kyle Gililland, Juris Doctor,
- ii) The three (3) faculty listed in the catalog and application are not duly qualified to teach the Master and Doctoral program in Education: Grace Chen, MA in

Internship, BA 5900 and ED 5900 Graduate Internship, BA 5990 and ED 5990 Master's Thesis, BA 6990 Doctoral Dissertation, ED 5950 Research and Design, ED 6850 Graduate Project, ED 6900 Internship in Education, ED 6950 The Doctoral Proposal: Research Design and Methodology, HU 1010 American Culture, HU 2040 Ethics, and SM 1010 Human Biology.

5. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR section 71715 subdivision (d)(3) in that Respondent failed to demonstrate that it employed competent faculty to develop the distance education curriculum and that are competent in distance education techniques.

f. Library.

- 1. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR section 71740 subdivision (b) and (d)(1)-(4) in that Respondent failed to make provisions for the library and other learning resources needed to support each educational program it offers, including resources such as reference works, periodicals, monographs, and media and equipment specific to the educational programs offered. Specifically, the education programs offered are Master and Doctoral Degree in Education, Doctoral Degree in Business Administration and Master of Science in Computer Information System. The University of the West, which is the main library resource for the Respondent, does not offer the above degrees so as to support or make provisions necessary for research resources.
- 2. Respondent failed to provide evidence that it has the capacity to meet the minimum operating standards under CCR section 71740 subdivision (d)(2) in that Respondent failed to provide a librarian that is a professional information specialist experienced in electronic retrieval of information. Specifically, the Respondent's librarian has a Masters of Science in Continuing Studies without prior experience as a librarian.

////

HH

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Denying the application of Central State University of Business and Technology; Kuang Chung Chen for a Approval to Operate Non-Accredited Institution;
 - 2. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.

DATED: May 16, 2014

Joanne Wenzel

Chief

Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education

Department of Consumer Affairs

State of California Complainant

LA2013510018 51471018.docx